



Let's look at both sides of the story, "Aid to Africa"

Grade Level:

9th Grade World Geography

Contributed by TAGE Teacher Consultant: Adam Smith

Edited By: Paul Macias

Rationale: The purpose of this lesson is to expose students to both sides of an issue. It is designed to get the students thinking about an issue, *not to teach them what to think about an issue*. I have chosen one issue for the introduction of this lesson.

In today's education and media culture, students seldom get to hear both sides of the story. There is usually a bias shown from these viewpoints. Again the teacher should be careful not to show any bias toward one side, rather to present both sides of the issue. At the end of the lesson the students will make a value judgment in having to pick one side of the issue and offer possible solutions to remedy the issue.

Time Frame: (Class periods and time)

3 to 4 days: 50 minute class periods

Learning Outcomes (Objectives specific to lesson plan):

1. Examine the pros and cons of current global, national and state current geographic issues.
2. Investigate both sides of an issue and determine the geographic impact on a global, national or state level.
3. Defend an issue and state reasons for their decision verbally and written.



TEKS Objective(s):

(15) Citizenship. The student understands how different points of view influence the development of public policies and decision-making processes on local, state, national, and international levels. The student is expected to:

- (A) identify and give examples of different points of view that influence the development of public policies and decision-making processes on local, state, national, and international levels; and
- (B) explain how citizenship practices, public policies, and decision making may be influenced by cultural beliefs, including nationalism and patriotism.

Various other TEKS will be used depending on debate topics chosen.

Materials: pen or pencils, Handout for Pro/Con Debates varies depending on subjects chosen. Links below are for introduction Day 1 only. Pro and Con T-Chart with questions, *See Below*
Questions handouts, *See Below*
Highlighters

Links to articles:

Africa Anti Aid

Aid 'Is Not A Solution' For Africa

<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/programmes/if/4105140.stm> 09/21/2012

Africa: A Tragic Continent

http://www.townhall.com/columnists/WalterEWilliams/2008/02/27/africa_a_tragic_continent 09/21/2012



“For Gods Sake Please Stop The Aid”

<http://www.spiegel.de/international/spiegel/0,1518,363663,00.html>

09/21/2012

Africa Pro aid

Another Reason Why Aid to Africa Must Increase

<http://blogs.worldbank.org/africacan/another-reason-why-aid-to-africa-must-increase> 09/21/2012

Panel Urges G-8 to Increase Africa Aid

<http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2008/06/15/AR2008061502081.html> 09/21/2012

Links for Extension: Malaria and DDT

For DDT

http://www.townhall.com/columnists/BillSteigerwald/2007/05/10/detoxifying_ddt%e2%80%99s_reputation 09/21/2012

Malaria in Africa

http://www.rollbackmalaria.org/cmc_upload/0/000/015/370/RBMInfosheet_3.htm

Diagrams:

Let's look at both sides of the story

Issue being examined:

On the T-chart below you are to list the pros and cons of the issue being discussed. You do not have to write complete sentences; simply use bullets, (only the facts).

Pro - (For)	Con - (Against)

--	--

Summaries: Briefly summarize each issue, 2-3 sentences

Teachers Answer Key for: Let's look at both sides of the story

Issue being examined: Aid to Africa

On the T-chart below you are to list the pros and cons of the issue being discussed. You do not have to write complete sentences; simply use bullets, (only the facts.)

Pro - (For, Good)	Con - (Against, Bad)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Need more aid</i> • <i>More \$ for rising food prices</i> • <i>Increase food supply</i> • <i>If decrease in aid, food crisis will ensue</i> • <i>Live on \$2 a day</i> • <i>200 million go hungry each day</i> • <i>Each year 1 million die of malaria</i> • <i>2 million die of aids each year</i> • <i>Aid used to pay debt</i> • <i>Unfair trade</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Countries with most aid worse off</i> • <i>Corruption</i> • <i>Become beggars, not independent</i> • <i>Weakens markets</i> • <i>Africans need to help themselves</i> • <i>Food imports discourage farming, if it's free or cheap, why farm?</i> • <i>No aid would promote trade</i> • <i>Africa has vast natural resources</i>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Aid \$ is working</i> • <i>Helping is the right and smart thing to do</i> • <i>Science and technology a historic opportunity</i> • <i>\$ for security</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Aids vastly exaggerated</i> • <i>Free cloths, tailors lose jobs</i> • <i>Africans are beggars, become victims</i> • <i>Africa should stand on its own two feet</i> • <i>Trillion dollars in aid in past 40 years</i> • <i>Colonialism not to blame</i>
---	--

Summaries: Briefly summarize each issue, 2-3 sentences

Africa needs more aid \$, for rising food prices, global warming, to fight corruption and for aids. Millions are dying every year. Need \$ for security and support

We have sent billions in aid with nothing to show. Africans must help themselves. Aid hurts the economy, farming jobs and others are lost. Aid makes Africa a continent of beggars and victims. Africa is rich in natural resources. Let Africa take care of itself

Let's look at both sides of the story

Questions:

1. Do you think there are some or any compromises the pro (for) side could make to the con (against) side to meet in the middle or be less of an argument?
2. Do you think there are some or any compromises the con (against) side could make to the pro (for) side to meet in the middle or be less of an argument?
3. Are there any geographic consequences (effects) that these issues might have the physical geography and the environment of Africa (the land)?
4. Are there any geographic consequences (effects) that these issues might have on the Human geography of Africa (the people)?
5. It is time for you the student to make a value judgment (a decision). Which of the two sides of the argument do you agree with? In your answer give several reasons to support your decision.

Strategies:

Debating:

<http://olc.spsd.sk.ca/de/pd/instr/strats/debates/index.html> 09/21/2012

Researching:

<http://olc.spsd.sk.ca/de/pd/instr/strats/researchprojects/index.html>

09/21/2012

Procedures:

Introduction Day 1:

1. Begin by posting the question, “What do you know about poverty in Africa and financial aid to Africa?” Have students brainstorm and list their thoughts and ideas on a half sheet of paper (3-4 minutes). While students are answering the introductory question distribute copies of articles and worksheets.
2. Call on students to solicit responses; remember to be impartial (2-3 minutes).
3. Explain to students that they are going to examine both sides of the issue “Aid to Africa.” Explain that some believe sending money (aid) is the best thing we can do to help Africans today and others believe aid is very detrimental and is the worst thing we can do to Africa.
4. Read the passages to the students. Pause and highlight the main points of each issue. This can be done together as a class; or, in the case of an honors or Pre-AP class, students could work on their own to determine the salient information. At this time you do not need to discuss the issues with the students that will come later in the lesson.
5. Have students transfer important facts or points of each side of the issue to their T-chart. One side of the issue can be completed then transfer the important points to the T-chart, then the other side of the issue read and transferred to the T-chart. I prefer one at a time. When finished review the important points from each side (pro and con).
6. Instruct students to briefly summarize the main argument from each side of the issue in the space provided under the T-chart. Discuss the main points from each side of the issue.
7. After discussion of the main points, have students answer questions on handout. Questions 1 and 2 could be done as a whole class activity or individually. Questions 3 and 4 are extension questions and are optional. To expedite matters, I choose the whole class method. For Question #5 students are on their own, this is their ticket out of the class.

Formative Lesson Day 2-4

1. Students will be paired off and be given a pro or con side to a global issue.
2. Students will research their issue looking for support for their side. Remember to look for groups of citizens that support your side, as well as economical, physical, environmental, and social support.
3. Students will debate the issues in class 2-minute presentations and 1-minute rebuttals.
4. Students can use the Pro/Con T-Chart to organize their thought, and should use visual aids during their debate.
5. Topics:
 1. Syria's Political Upheaval
 2. Israel and Iran Potential Conflict Over Nuclear Arms.
 3. Illegal Immigration Issues Between United States and Mexico (also between various European countries and illegal immigration).
 4. Tibet and China.
 5. North and South Sudan's Religious issues.
 6. Pakistan and India, Two Nuclear Countries
 7. Oil Issues Between the United States and Saudi Arabia.
 8. North and South Korea Border Issues.
 9. United States Drill or Don't Drill.
 10. Others

Evaluation/Assessment

Day 1

Students are assessed on worksheets, participation in questioning and response to their value judgment.

Day 2-4

Students will debate their topics, supporting a position, either Pro or Con. Students will be expected to use research evidence that supports their

side. This should include, but not be limited to evidence regarding religion, economy, citizens, geography, military, and outside influences.

The Rubric below can be used or modified for evaluation.

If time allows, it would be best if students in class were allowed to fill out the Rubric below. This would allow them to evaluate the evidence, and judge for themselves whose side was better supported (Relates directly to Rationale, and outcomes).

POPULATION COMPARISON CRITIQUE SHEET

Rubric

Name _____ Date _____ Class _____

1. The Student followed the guidelines given for completing this research.
2. The Student demonstrates knowledge of their Pro or Con Side.
3. The Students demonstrates the ability to communicate effectively.
4. The student demonstrates new knowledge that the student has gained as a result of the research.
5. The information clearly illustrated an understanding of the issue they are debating.
6. The information clearly illustrated an understanding of the issues effect on the economy, resources, and society.
7. The students came up with persuasive arguments to support their findings.

10	8	6	4	2
10	8	6	4	4
10	8	6	4	2
15	8	6	4	2
20	16	12	8	4
20	16	12	8	4
15	8	6	4	2

Final Grade: _____

Comments: